Assessing Health Impacts of DTE's 15-Year Energy Plan

And how a Public Health approach can advance Environmental Justice in the COVID context

Michelle Martinez
MI Environmental Justice Coalition

Dr. Tony Reames
UM-SEAS

Dr. Amy Schulz
UM-SPH

Dr. Carina Gronlund
UM-SPH

Nina Ignaczak
Planet Detroit
planetdetroit.org

WORK FOR ME, DTE!

NIH

MICHIGAN ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE COALITION

SCHOOL OF PUBLIC HEALTH LIFESTAGE ENVIRONMENTAL EXPOSURES AND DISEASE CENTER UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN
Health Impact Assessments as a tool for Energy & Public Planning

27 May 2020

Carina Gronlund, Ph.D., MPH
Michelle Martinez, MS Env. Policy
Tony Reames, Ph.D., PE
Amy Schulz, Ph.D., MPH

Moderated by: Nina Ignaczak
Publisher, Planet Detroit
planetdetroit.org
Welcome

- Thinking about energy, air pollution, health impacts & equity
- Looking at fundamental cause and cumulative risk
- What is cumulative impact? What does science say about it? What is the legal framework?
- What is the "precautionary principle" and how does it relate to this story?

Dr. Amy Schulz, amy@schulz.com
What are health impact assessments?

- Consider health impacts of proposals BEFORE decisions are finalized and implemented
- Information about likely/probable health impacts to inform the decision

Dr. Amy Schulz, amy@schulz.com
Summary: Health Impact Assessment of DTE IRP

The benefits of energy production are disproportionately realized in surrounding areas.

Health costs associated with exposure to air pollution generated by DTE power plants are not currently considered as part of the decision making process for energy planning.

Dr. Amy Schulz, amy@schulz.com
HIAs as part of democratic decision making

Include recommendations to:

1) Reduce adverse health impacts,
2) More equitably distribute health costs & benefits

Dr. Amy Schulz, amy@schulz.com
Why did MEJC get into HIA work around DTE’s IRP?

2017
- DTE ENERGY GAS EXPANSION
- Certificate of Necessity for the Blue Water Facility
- Ongoing fight in River Rouge for Just Transition monies
- Construction of the Nexus and Rover Pipelines

2018
- Gas in Dearborn MI
- Dearborn Industrial Generation Facility-Consumer’s Subsidiary
- CON Approval
- DTE-Ford Natural Gas Permit

2019
- DTE Integrated Resource Plan
- DTE Energy “Public Meetings”
- Health Impact Assessment
- Direct Intervention Rate Cases
- MPSC IRP Hearing June 2019

2020
- DTE IRP Decision
- ALJ judgement that HIA should be considered in IRP
- MPSC ruling that EGLE does that work
- COVID-19 Emergency Situation: Demanding #turniton #keepiton

Michelle Martinez, ejcoalition.michigan@gmail.com
What is an Integrated Resource Plan?

“An Integrated Resource Plan (IRP) is a roadmap for how an electric utility will meet its future electricity needs to serve customers in a cost-effective, reliable manner. A plan addresses issues such as the utility’s expected customer demand, retirement of existing power plants, and the timing and amount of new electricity sources such as natural gas fired generation and renewable energy. A plan also addresses programs that assist customers in reducing their energy waste, which can help to lower utility bills, increase electric reliability, and positively impact the environment now and well into the future. An approved IRP allows for the utility to obtain pre-approval for the recovery of costs of specific near-term projects proposed in the plan. Public Act 341 of 2016 requires all investor-owned utilities to submit IRPs to the Michigan Public Service Commission (MPSC or Commission) for review and approval.”


Michelle Martinez, ejcoalition.michigan@gmail.com
Energy Democracy: Energy decision-making

1. What: Total investment costs of DTE = rising costs of bills
2. How: Direct lobbying and “soft money” in foundation dollars
3. Who: Energy consumers are locked out → Shutoff numbers
4. Why: Have a voice vs. have a say – direct and unmitigated pathway to decision-making through interventions, public hearings

Michelle Martinez, ejcoalition.michigan@gmail.com
Residential Electricity Consumption

Higher electricity consumption in the suburbs

Lower electricity consumption in Detroit, Pontiac, and other cities closer to Detroit.

Homes in red areas are consuming 2 TIMES MORE ELECTRICITY than homes in yellow areas

Dr. Tony Reames, treames@umich.edu
Residential Energy (In)Efficiency

This map allows us to compare apples to apples. It normalizes electricity consumption by home size (square feet).

If homes were equally efficient, the map would be one color.

The distribution in this map is an inverse of the consumption map.

Homes in red areas are 2 TIMES LESS ENERGY EFFICIENT than homes in yellow areas.

Dr. Tony Reames, treames@umich.edu
Residential electricity cost burdens

Average monthly cost for electricity in Michigan $97.41 or $1,169/year (US EIA)

An affordable energy burden is 6% of household income (2% for just electricity)

Positive correlation between EUI and burden

~200,000 electricity shutoffs performed per year

At the start of COVID-19, 50,000 accounts were in arrears and at least 11,060 accounts without power

Dr. Tony Reames, treames@umich.edu
Electricity consumption

Cumulative vulnerability
(% below poverty, % without GED, median household income (reverse), % renters, linguistic isolation, %<5 years, %≥65 years)

Dr. Amy Schulz, amy@schulz.com
Annual health costs per person associated with extreme heat are higher in areas with less residential air conditioning availability.

Dr. Carina Gronlund, gronlund@umich.edu
DTE Air Pollution Exposure

PM2.5 (ug/m^3)
- 0.026 - 0.084
- 0.085 - 0.142
- 0.143 - 0.200
- 0.201 - 0.258
- 0.259 - 0.316

DTE Stacks TRI-County
- Coal
- Natural Gas and Oil
- MI TRI-County HWY
- Interstate HWY
- DTW Airport
- TRI County Boundaries
- City of Detroit Boundaries

Dr. Carina Gronlund, gronlund@umich.edu
Annual Health Costs per Person Attributable to Air Pollution from DTE Power Plants - Age Standardized

Dr. Carina Gronlund, gronlund@umich.edu
Annual Rates of Asthma Symptom Days and Mortality Attributable to Air Pollution from DTE Power Plants

Dr. Carina Gronlund, gronlund@umich.edu
Annual Health Costs per Person Attributable to Air Pollution from DTE Power Plants

Dr. Carina Gronlund, gronlund@umich.edu
The costs of energy production, including the health impacts of pollution generated, fall disproportionately in low to moderate income neighborhoods.

Those neighborhoods are disproportionately African American and Latinx.

The health burden - and associated costs - also fall more heavily on the youngest and the oldest members of DMA communities.
Recommendations: DTE IRP

- Health Impact Assessments should be required components of IRPs
- Allow us to see the health costs associated with current energy production and incorporate them into decision making process
- Affordability assessments should include health costs of pollution generated by energy production.

Dr. Amy Schulz, amy@schulz.com
Recommendations: DTE IRP

- Safety assessments should include consideration of health impacts.
- When uncertain about health impacts, cleaner, safer forms of energy production (e.g., solar) should be prioritized.
- Impacts of energy production on climate change should be considered as part of assessment of “affordability” and “safety.”

Dr. Amy Schulz, amy@schulz.com
Toward Energy Justice

- Health Impact Assessments are a tool to rectify energy injustice and environmental injustice.
- Energy Justice means benefits and burdens distributed without respect to race/income/etc., and burdens are reduced as much as possible.
- Our profit-driven, monopoly energy system, regulated by an agency who has little accountability to impacted communities, does not advance energy justice. Most impacted communities, as seen from HIA, must wield power in the decision-making process.

Michelle Martinez, ejcoalitionmichigan@gmail.com
Links to resources

CAPHE’s Public Health Action Plan:  http://caphedetroit.sph.umich.edu/

CAPHE’s Resource Manual:

Emissions and health impacts in DMA:

Planet Detroit - Weekly, local environmental news:  https://planetdetroit.org/

Michigan Environmental Justice Coalition:  https://www.michiganej.org/

Support Work for Me DTE:  https://work4medte.good.do/covid-19/MPSC/
Contact

Carina Gronlund, Ph.D., MPH  gronlund@umich.edu
Michelle Martinez, MS Env. Policy  ejcoalition.michigan@gmail.com
Tony Reames, Ph.D., PE  treames@umich.edu
Amy Schulz, Ph.D., MPH  amy@schulz.com